

GGC/HVSF Draft Scoping Document

Public Written Comments Received between 9/15/22-10/27/22



CHERYL ROCKETT <crockett@phillpstown.com>

Garrison Golf Course

3 messages

Jay Brenner <jaybrennerphoto@icloud.com>

Wed, Oct 19, 2022 at 1:19 PM

To: Klm Conner <kconner@phillpstown.com>, Dennis Gagnon <dgagnon@phillpstown.com>, Peter Lewis <plewis@phillpstown.com>, Laura O'Connell <loconnell@phillpstown.com>, Cheryl Rockett <crockett@phillpstown.com>, Neal Tomann <ntomann@phillpstown.com>, Heidi Wendel <hwendel@phillpstown.com>, Neal Zuckerman <nzuckerman@phillpstown.com>

Cc: Locals Hvsf <HVSFLocals@gmail.com>

First and foremost, I want to thank the Planning Board for all the hard work you all do to help preserve the beauty of Garrison!

I am writing about the Garrison Golf Course and the growth of the Hudson Valley Shakespeare Project.

My big concern at this point is sound testing. I truly believe that before you can give a Negative Declaration for the project, they need to put speakers at the proposed new site of the tent and then project the sound in all directions. The sample sounds should represent various sound bites of musicals and dramas and be recorded at homes that might be affected. This will ensure that the placement of the new tent will not jeopardize the peace and tranquility that we now have.

We are also concerned about the dark and confusing turn from rt 9 onto Snake Hill Road. We need a streetlight to illuminate this corner. It is easy to miss the turn when you approach from the North or South causing sudden braking or making the turn too fast. We really need a streetlight and a more visible street sign whether or not a traffic light is placed at this intersection. (We are opposed to this light...it will make the intersection more dangerous)

Please consider this when you are moving forward on this project!

Thank you,

Jay Brenner, Patty Berwald

[29 Snake Hill Road](#)

[Garrison, NY](#)

Jay Brenner
516-313-7670
jay@brennerphoto.com
29 Snake Hill Road
Garrison NY 10524

RECEIVED

OCT 19 2022

CR

CHERYL ROCKETT <crockett@phillpstown.com>

Fri, Oct 21, 2022 at 12:38 PM

To: Ron Gainer <rjgainer@comcast.net>, Steve Gaba <sgaba@drakeloeb.com>

[Quoted text hidden]

CHERYL ROCKETT <crockett@phillpstown.com>

Fri, Oct 21, 2022 at 12:38 PM

To: A Russo <arusso@akrf.com>, Aaron Werner <awerner@akrf.com>, Adam Stolorow <astolorow@sprlaw.com>, Alex Auld <aauld@akrf.com>, Alexandra Patrone <apatrone@atworkllc.com>, chip alleman <chipalleman@thegarrison.com>, Chris Davis <chris@dsaco.com>, Davis McCallum <dmccallum@hvshakespeare.org>, glenn watson <gwatson@badey-

Town of Philipstown Planning Board Meeting October 20, 2022

RE: Public Hearing on Draft Scoping Document/DEIS for Application by Garrison Properties, Inc./Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival (“GPI/HVSF Application”) for the project called “Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival”

TO: Neal Zuckerman, Chairman Philipstown Planning Board

FROM: Nathaniel Prentice, 848 Route 9D, Garrison, NY

Reference: Section D., III., Sub-Section C., 2. (page 5) of the DEIS addresses the issues of public need/benefit and consistency with the goals of the Town as outlined in the Town’s Comprehensive Plan.

My Comment: The Comprehensive Plan presents Goals that are intended to be broad and aspirational; these Goals, and the Strategies and Action Items, that go with them neither permit nor deny anything specific. Like “beauty” what the Plan says “is in the eye of the beholder”. As a beholder, I believe that the GPI/HVSF Application, assuming we all get satisfactory answers to our questions, is generally consistent with the Comprehensive Plan.

The application is particularly well-aligned with **Goal 5, Strategy V., Action Item 22** (protect environmentally sensitive areas identified in the (Town’s) Natural Resource Protection Plan (which the Garrison Golf Club is) and **Goal 7, Strategy I., Action Item 2** (recognize the importance of nonprofits because of their affinity with the town and their contributions to the town’s quality of life).

Respectfully Submitted, Nat Prentice 845-661-8937

RECEIVED

OCT 20 2022



JOSEPH C. MAHON
16 Fox Hollow Lane
P.O. Box 246
Garrison, N.Y. 10524

October 26, 2022

Hon. Neal Zuckerman, Chair
And Members of the Planning Board
Town of Philipstown
2 Cedar Street
Cold Spring, New York 10516

Re: Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival – SEQUA Draft Scope

Dear Planning Board,

I am writing to provide comments on the Draft Scope for the preparation of a DEIS for the Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival / Garrison Golf Course project (the HVSF Project).

I write as a full time resident of Philipstown who supports the conversion of the golf course property into the permanent home for HVSF, an asset of our town enjoyed for 30 years. While I am a financial supporter and a former member of the Board of HVSF, this letter reflects my personal views.

Hopefully, these comments may provide perspective that moves the HVSF Project forward to realization, given its significance to Philipstown in so many ways. In providing these comments, there is no intention to be inconsiderate to anyone who resides near the site or to any member of our community. Rather, the goal is to recognize the greater good that benefits Philipstown as a whole.

At Section D.IV, of the Draft Scope, p. 6, seven areas of concern are listed. With regard to all these areas, the HVSF Project is either an improvement for our town or is non-controversial.

The document describes a 142 acre parcel being divided into three lots, with 17.1 acres going to Hudson Highland Land Trust for conservation, 27.5 acres being reserved for a single family home, and 97.4 acres going to the HVSF Project. Obviously, the entire parcel is not being built out.

Rather the bulk of the property (124.5/142) is going to not-for-profit entities, with the bulk of the land repurposed for passive recreation that is less burdensome and provides broader public access than its prior use as a golf course with its fairways, greens, water features and sand traps.

Understanding that virtually all of the US east of the Mississippi has been clear cut for either farm, industrial or residential use, the HVSF Project provides a spectacular opportunity to

RECEIVED

OCT 26 2022

cl

enhance vegetation and wildlife while managing plant selection and minimizing invasive species. It provides a similar opportunity to improve overall water quality by managing the property without the use of fertilizers or other chemicals and without the need for mowing required by the golf course. With regard to existing water features, it should be remembered that they are not all naturally occurring but rather have been man made for purposes no longer appropriate to the ongoing use of the property.

With regard to concerns about utilities, the HVSF revised proposal to build a LEED certified facility speaks for itself. Of particular interest is the opportunity to employ subdued lighting consistent with what has already been done at the Cold Spring waterfront, reducing impact on nocturnal fauna.

With regard to traffic, the HVSF Project is for a smaller theatre facility than its current tent, previously used at Boscobel. The new site moves the traffic closer to the major corridors of Route 9, Route 84 and the Taconic Parkway, and takes the bulk of the traffic away from Routes 9D, 301 and 403. As is indicated in the Draft Scope, the HVSF Project also provides the occasion for improving the interaction of Rt. 9 with Snake Hill Road and Travis Corners Road, where residents of Philipstown have died in traffic accidents.

With regard to visual resources, the revised HVSF proposal is as admirable as it is attractive, reducing the profile of the theatre building while combining within it several functions to eliminate the need for ancillary buildings, and providing natural screening through trees and other plantings. And, it should be remembered that on a regional basis, the proposed site for the theatre building is not a protected ridgeline, rendering concerns about the building non-controversial in any event. The Draft Scope lists numerous viewpoints that are not located in Philipstown, when the larger regional authorities have already indicated that the proposed site is not within a view shed sought to be protected. This is clearly an issue that should not burden Philipstown's efforts to maintain and enhance its resources and community.

With regard to noise, a 500 seat any not-for-profit theatre does not present the prospect of a public nuisance. No examples of any remotely comparable activity creating a noise problem have been provided. Activities that commonly create noise problems are landscaping equipment (which will be minimized by the proposed use for passive recreation), motorcycles, fireworks, and large stadium events involving crowds 10 to 100 times the size of HVSF. The suggestion that the facility could be converted into a venue for loud music events such as rock concerts is similarly unfounded. No real world examples of not-for-profit organizations conducting such events in 500 seat venues have been provided. Again, while neighbors and the community need to be treated considerately in the planning process, exaggerating issues renders a disservice to our entire community by burdening the HVSF Project with unnecessary costs and delays.

The economic plan for Philipstown has been its development as a community for persons working in nearby labor markets, including NYC. To maintain its tax base, Philipstown needs to maintain its resources and amenities attractive to the residential community it has targeted. We are already familiar with and support the HVSF. It provides a reason for prospective buyers to purchase property here, supporting the values of our homes and our tax base.

The HVSF Project will enhance the Festival and the site as community resources, opening up the property to the public for passive recreation, as well as enhancing the site as an environment sustaining and improving flora, fauna and water quality (all of which benefits the site's closest neighbors the most). And, on a very pragmatic humans level, the HVSF Project provides our youth with the opportunities for jobs (not drug addiction), and our residents with safer intersections for traveling from one side of town to the other.

For all of these reasons, this Board should proceed to approve the HVSF Project. Your consideration of these comments is appreciated.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Joseph M. ...", followed by a horizontal line.



SCENIC HUDSON, INC.
 One Civic Center Plaza,
 Suite 200
 Poughkeepsie, NY 12601-3157
 Tel: 845 473 4440
 Fax: 845 473 2648
 ScenicHudson.org

October 25, 2022

Neal Zuckerman, Chair
 And members of the Planning Board
 Town of Phillipstown
 2 Cedar St.
 Cold Spring, NY 10516
 Email: crockett@philipstown.com

Re: Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival (HVSF) Scoping Comments

Dear Mr. Zuckerman and Members of the Planning Board:

Scenic Hudson Inc. fights threats to the river and natural resources of the Valley and seeks to advance projects that adhere to our established principles and values as outlined in our published guide, *Revitalizing Hudson Riverfronts*. We review many projects throughout the Valley during (SEQRA) environmental review processes and add our voice to those of community members for consideration by planning boards or other lead agencies.

Scenic Hudson staff reviewed the HVSF's Draft Scope, and we respectfully request that the following comments be entered into the record:

- **Section D.III.B.2.**

PROPOSED ZONING AMENDMENTS

Scenic Hudson supports this Section of the Draft Scope as written.

- We believe that the proposed zoning amendment that would allow the theater and ancillary buildings will be a benefit as it would help avert the prospect of a future residential subdivision or other more impactful development on the property;

- **Section IV.A**

VEGETATION AND WILDLIFE

Section IV.A.3.a. (Land Conservation), Scenic Hudson supports provisions in the Draft Scope that identify Existing Conditions, Potential Impacts, and Mitigation Measures for any impacts identified as they relate to Vegetation and Wildlife. Several factors have combined to support this finding.

- The +/-56.6-acre portion of the site already deeded to the Hudson Highlands Land Trust, and +/-17.1-acre to be subdivided and deeded to the Hudson Highlands Land Trust will protect existing habitat and even provide additional habitat for flora and fauna.
- The applicant's plans to restore approximately eight acres of fairways, tees, and greens would provide additional habitat and mitigate the potential loss of habitat that may occur through the development of other portions of the site.
- Finally, nearly 100 acres of the site will be subjected to a recorded declaration to ensure that the land will be used only for not-for-profit cultural and conservation uses. To ensure these uses in perpetuity, The Scenic Hudson Land Trust has agreed to accept a reversionary interest in this portion of the site. This provides that The Scenic Hudson Land Trust will have the right to take ownership of these lands, again for conservation purposes, should the HVSF ever dissolve or

RECEIVED

OCT 26 2022

OR

become insolvent and a suitable successor is not found to use the land consistent with the recorded restrictions;

Section IV C

UTILITIES (Water, Sewer, and Energy)

Scenic Hudson supports provisions in the Draft Scope that identify the mitigation of energy impacts by utilizing LEED Platinum design practices.

- We believe that the facility's LEED Platinum design, the highest possible LEED rating, responds to concerns regarding energy use;

- **Section IV.D**

TRAFFIC, TRANSPORTATION, AND PARKING

Scenic Hudson supports provisions in the Draft Scope that identify Traffic and Parking Impacts and ways to mitigate them.

- We understand traffic was a community concern, but it is our understanding as per the statement made by a representative of the applicant at the 10/20/22 Scoping Session that the HVSF had received no complaints regarding traffic during the Summer 2022 performance season;

- **Section IV.D**

VISUAL RESOURCES AND COMMUNITY CHARACTER

Scenic Hudson supports provisions in the Draft Scope that identify Existing Conditions, Potential Impacts, and Mitigation Measures for any impacts identified as they relate to Visual Impact and Community Character.

- Scenic Hudson staff examined the previously submitted visual analysis, including sight lines and simulations, and concluded that the large white tent as previously proposed would not have resulted in adverse visual impacts from key offsite viewpoints. But further, in response to community concerns and to its credit, the applicant has redesigned the performance space as a lower, timber and stone open-air pavilion whose roof mimics and blends with adjacent hills. We believe this additional significant improvement will further ensure that no adverse visual impacts would result from vantage points nearby and from afar, including Route 9, other adjacent roads, parks, and public places such as Storm King and the Hudson River itself.

Conclusion

For these reasons, Scenic Hudson supports the HVSF's Draft Scope. Scenic Hudson also supports the Hudson Valley Shakespeare Festival's plan to establish a permanent home at The Garrison. We hope that the Planning Board, community, and applicant will continue to work together to see this project through to fruition.

Very truly yours,



Jeffrey Anzevino, AICP
Director of Land Use Advocacy

stephen + sarah wallis

To: The Philipstown Planning Board
Re: HVSF Application Scope

We once again thank the Philipstown Planning Board for all of its hard work dealing with the HVSF / GGC application.

We would like to share our observations regarding sound issues that we experienced during the HVSF 2022 season performances at the GGC.

There were many times when we would be confronted with noises emanating from the direction of the temporary tent where the HVSF was performing. The noises were almost always in the late evenings and would include percussion, music and voices.

Some of these disturbances occurred over many hours.

There were also times during this past summer where we would be disturbed by the sounds of people talking and laughing after midnight, which we assume were people in the parking lot hanging out after an event.

We have never heard any of these sounds over the past 15 years that we have lived here on Philipse Brook Road. Our house is quite high up and we are very concerned about how the sounds will travel, both from performances, audiences, and especially from any housing to be built directly in front of where we live.

We ask that the planning board limit any and all possible noise disturbances that can affect our quality of life.

In this regard, we also ask the planning board and the HVSF to limit any housing that is to be built within earshot of us to respect the zoning codes that are presently in effect, meaning one single residential house within 10 acre RC zoning. We cannot accept the possibility of having multiple "tiny houses" clustered close to our home with the chances that actors who do not own nor rent their homes create noise disturbances late at night. This also includes the chances of these "tiny homes" being rented out for any STR's (short term rentals).

Also, we are still concerned about any environmental impacts that could possibly occur due to the thousands of people visiting the HVSF performances and events. These concerns still regard the amount of water usage, creation of wastewater, traffic, etc.

Finally, in reaction to the HVSF lawyer stating that the only alternative to the ambitious development that HVSF is proposing is a large development, we believe that a development on over 90 acres within the present zoning could yield only 9 SFR sustainable houses with possible access to the local community for hiking etc. as a condition to the developer. The result could be much needed property/school taxes vs. the non profit HVSF.

We do not write that we are against the HVSF becoming our close neighbor, only that there are other possible uses to the GGC property that could have much less environmental and resource impacts, with a much larger property tax base for our community services and school.

Sincerely,

Stephen & Sarah Wallis